

LANDMARKS COMMISSION

July 13, 2023

LAN20230713-1

UNAPPROVED

A regular meeting of the Landmarks Commission, City of Cedarburg, Wisconsin, was held Thursday, July 13, 2023 at Cedarburg City Hall, W63 N645 Washington Avenue, lower level, Room 1.

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Tom Kubala at 8:30 a.m.

Roll Call: Present – Tom Kubala, James Pape, Council Member Pat Thome,
Beth Krimmel, Doug Yip, Tomi Fay Forbes, Chris Smith

Also Present – City Planner Jon Censky

STATEMENT OF PUBLIC NOTICE

Chairperson Kubala acknowledged that the agenda for this meeting was posted and distributed in compliance with the Wisconsin Open Meetings Law.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion made by Commissioner Krimmel, seconded by Commissioner Yip, to approve the minutes of the June 8, 2023 meeting. Motion carried without a negative vote with Council Member Thome abstaining.

COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS FROM CITIZENS – none

REGULAR BUSINESS

Applicant is Requesting Site and Architectural Modifications for the Port Washington State Bank, Property Located at W61N526 Washington Avenue, and Action Thereon

Architect Matthew Hensel presented the proposed plans for the Port Washington State Bank on Washington Avenue. The project involves the replacement of some asphalt, the removal of concrete, and the removal of a planter located on the north side of the building. The area currently occupied by the planter will become an addition to the building, housing additional offices, a workroom, and an employee lounge. The area to be expanded encompasses approximately 600 square feet.

The exterior will have a more cohesive and balanced façade by bringing the mass of the present entry down, adding arched windows on the north side that will complement the present arched windows on the west side, replacing some existing fieldstone with case stone, and matching the existing brick and belt courses.

Chairperson Kubala stated that he appreciated the reduction of the scale of the entrance. Commissioner Pape expressed appreciation for the exterior proposal of the building.

Action: Commissioner Krimmel made a motion to accept the project as proposed. Council Member Thome seconded the motion. The motion carried without a negative vote.

Applicant is Requesting to Replace Aluminum Siding with Hardyboard/Smartside Siding on the Front (West) Side of the Building for Wyndrose Fine Jewelry, Located at W62N598 Washington Avenue, and Action Thereon

Commissioner Smith recused himself for this agenda item.

Ann and Greg Denk represented the business. Mrs. Denk stated the following reasons for the request:

- The current aluminum siding is not in good repair.
- She assumes that when the siding is removed, wood in poor condition will probably be discovered. The other three sides of the building are wood, so the assumption is that the façade was covered in aluminum siding to cover the deterioration of the original wood.
- She views Hardyboard/Smartside as a clear improvement to the building over the aluminum siding.
- She wishes to maintain the building.
- Hardyboard was approved three years ago for the McCutcheon Barber Shop, so a precedent was set.
- The cost of replacing the façade with cedar is estimated to be about 5 times the cost of the proposed Hardyboard. Mrs. Denk stated that she is advocating for her business and for others who may not be able to afford the cost of complete restorations.
- The aluminum siding has lead paint, which means there is extra cost for replacement/disposal.

The Commissioners then responded to her request.

If there is original material under the aluminum siding, it needs to be restored or replaced. It was not unusual to sell aluminum siding as an improvement, even if the original siding is in good shape, so what lays underneath might not be in bad shape. Furthermore, while Hardyboard is marketed as an improvement, it is contrary to the Commission's standing orders to preserve as much material as possible.

The previous approval of Hardyboard material for the siding of McCutcheon's Barber Shop was brought up due to the Wyndrose Jewelry building's similarity in request. Both structures are contributing, not pivotal buildings within the Historic District. The Commissioners acknowledged that the approval of the Hardyboard for McCutcheon's Barber Shop should not have happened and should therefore not be repeated. Council Member Thome stated that yes, there are times that the Landmarks Commission allows something, but as new information is presented, the next time the issue comes up, they do not allow it. One mistake should not multiply into multiple mistakes. It is the Commission's responsibility to protect the downtown.

It was emphasized that every time something is covered over or removed, it contributes to a slow deterioration of the City's historic nature. The installation of siding inevitably results in the removal of pertinent building details. In fact, a letter is being composed which will go out to all building owners later this year with reminders of the parameters within which buildings in the Historic District must be maintained.

Commissioners wished to know what lay underneath the aluminum siding. They wanted to know if there was wood that could be repainted, or whether there is a fair amount of damage to the original wood siding. They also wanted to find out if the original siding was removed and then replaced with aluminum siding which could open other possibilities for repair.

Commissioner Krimmel asked if the siding could be left as is until the time that the Denks, or a future owner, are able to tackle the restoration of the wood façade. Mrs. Denk responded that the old aluminum siding does not look attractive on the façade. Some possible solutions offered were applying for a \$5,000 grant to work on the façade and/or applying for available tax credits to help with the cost of the project.

Action: Council Member Thome made a motion to deny the request to replace aluminum siding with Hardyboard pending submission of identification and evaluation of the condition of the underlying material. Commissioner Pape seconded the motion. The motion carried without a negative vote with Commissioner Smith recused.

Applicant is Requesting Sign Plan Approval to Replace the Existing *Settler's Inn* Projecting Sign Over Their Main Entrance to *Dorsey's Café and Market*, Located at W63N657 Washington Avenue, and Action Thereon

Applicant Bryan Dorsey stated that the new sign will go into the existing bracket, enclosing the present sign, and that there will be no illumination of the sign, nor any changes in dimensions from the old sign.

Action: Commissioner Pape made a motion to accept the sign plan as proposed, Commissioner Krimmel seconded the motion. The motion carried without a negative vote.

COMMENTS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS BY LANDMARKS COMMISSIONERS

Commissioners had no comments or announcements.

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Commissioner Yip, seconded by Commissioner Krimmel, to adjourn the meeting at 9:40 a.m.

Tomi Fay Forbes
Secretary

dos