

LANDMARKS COMMISSION
August 13, 2020

LAN20200813-1
UNAPPROVED

A regular meeting of the Landmarks Commission, City of Cedarburg, Wisconsin, was held Thursday, August 13, 2020 at Cedarburg City Hall, W63N645 Washington Avenue, second floor, Council Chambers.

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Judy Jepson at 7:00 p.m.

Roll Call: Present – Judy Jepson, Tomi Fay Forbes, Tom Kubala, Council Member
Barbara Lythjohan, Doug Yip (alt.)

Excused – Jeffrey Ellmaker, James Pape, Robert Ross

Also Present – City Planner Jon Censky

STATEMENT OF PUBLIC NOTICE

Chairperson Jepson acknowledged that the agenda for this meeting was posted and distributed in compliance with the Wisconsin Open Meetings Law.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion was made by Commissioner Yip, seconded by Commissioner Kubala, to approve the minutes of the July 9, 2020 meeting. Motion carried without a negative vote with Commissioners Ellmaker, Pape and Ross excused.

COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS FROM CITIZENS – None

REGULAR BUSINESS

Consider Exterior Changes to Painting and Reroofing the Cedar Corporation Building Located at W61N497 Washington Avenue; and Action Thereon.

Douglas Kroes of Cedar Corporation submitted a request to consider exterior changes to their office, which is housed inside a historic colonial revival home located on the southwest corner of Washington Avenue and Western Road. The changes proposed are to the accent trim color and roofing materials, described as follows in the request submitted by Cedar Corporation.

Request No 1: Change the accent trim color from Blackberry to Isle of Pines

As part of their 2020 property improvement plan, Cedar Corporation would like to make repairs to the exterior siding as well as repaint the entire building. Since they are planning to maintain the current color base and large trim colors, this request is based on the building's accent trim. Currently dark purple in color, the proposal is to change it to hunter green.

Commissioner Kubala established that he had helped with the present color scheme on the building, which was approved by the Landmarks Commission during their May 22, 2003 meeting. In his opinion, the proposed green trim would not complement the building as well as the present trim color does; however, it does match the Cedar Corporation color scheme.

Action:

Commissioner Yip made a motion to accept the proposed accent trim color change. Commissioner Forbes seconded the motion. Motion carried without a negative vote with Commissioners Ellmaker, Pape and Ross excused.

Request No 2: Change roof material from cedar shake shingles to dimensional tab fiberglass shingles

Also included in the Petitioner's 2020 property improvement plan is the replacement of the existing cedar shake roof. They are currently experiencing leaks within the cedar shake roof which is nearing the end of its life cycle. Due to the costs associate with replacing the existing roof, they are proposing to replace it with green fiberglass dimension tab shingles, which, along with the proposed trim color, they believe will enhance the appearance of the building and complement the architectural style.

Commissioner Kubala ruminated that it can be difficult for owners to spend the money needed to maintain historic buildings with appropriate materials. Since this building is located within the boundaries of the Washington Avenue Historic District and has historic associations to the City, it is considered to be a contributing property to the historic integrity of the District. Commissioner Kubala remarked that when the home was built in 1885, the original roof was probably made of either metal or sawn shingles. He pointed out that the current shingles are split shake, which he feels is not historically appropriate to the building; however, he considers an asphalt roof even less appropriate.

Commissioner Kubala recalled a similar situation brought before the Landmarks Commission during their August 23, 2018 meeting, when the roof on the St. Francis Borgia Church was replaced. On that occasion, asphalt shingles that were made to look like sawn shingles were proposed and approved.

Planner Censky presented the Commission with the exact wording of the City's Building Code, **Section 15-1-14(d)(3)(bb), Requirements for the Restoration and/or Rehabilitation of Historic Properties Designated by the Landmarks Commission, Roof Material**, states *if the existing roofing material is asphalt shingles, sawn wood shingles or a non-historic material, such as fiberglass, all repairs shall match in appearance the existing roof material; however, if any such roof is covered or replaced, reroofing must be done using rectangular sawn wood shingles or rectangular shingles that are similar in width, thickness and apparent length to sawn wood shingles, for example, 3-in-1 tab asphalt shingles and dimensional asphalt/fiberglass are recommended.*

In accordance with the Code, Planner Censky recommends requesting the Petitioner return to the next Landmarks Commission meeting with a plan that includes sample materials consistent with what the Code allows.

Consensus among Commission Members is that they prefer the installation of sawn wood shingles. However, if the owner is going to replace the roof with asphalt shingles, they should be similar in width, length, thickness and appearance to sawn wood shingles.

Action:

Commissioner Yip made a motion to withhold action on the use of the proposed roofing material until the applicant submits sample materials to the Landmarks Commission that are consistent with what the Code allows. Council Member Lythjohan seconded the motion. Motion carried without a negative vote with Commissioners Ellmaker, Pape and Ross excused.

Consider Resolution 2020-01 Commending Joe DeRose of the Wisconsin Historical Society for His Years of Service and Support for the City of Cedarburg; and Action Thereon.

Commissioner Forbes made a motion to accept Resolution 2020-01 as presented. Commissioner Yip seconded the motion. Motion carried without a negative vote with Commissioners Ellmaker, Pape and Ross excused.

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Council Member Lythjohan, seconded by Commissioner Yip, to adjourn the meeting at 7:23 p.m. Motion carried without a negative vote with Commissioners Ellmaker, Pape and Ross excused.

Tomi Fay Forbes
Secretary

vrg